

APPENDICES

- | | |
|--------------------|--|
| Appendix 1 | Strategic context |
| Appendix 2 | Action Research – Micro Projects and Artists’ Feedback on the process |
| Appendix 3 | National Policy and Legislative Framework – summary of key legislation and report |
| Appendix 4 | Overview of policy documents, strategic reports and current policy/action plans in the West Midlands, from 1988 |
| Appendix 5 | Definitions – African, Caribbean and Asian – further exploration |
| Appendix 6 | Value and Difference |
| Appendix 7 | Regional Galleries’ engagement with African, Caribbean and Asian Visual Arts, and work by individual curators |
| Appendix 8 | Access to Higher education in Art and Design |
| Appendix 9 | Case Studies |
| Appendix 10 | Analysis of fact finding and professional development information from artists’ survey |
| Appendix 11 | Bibliography |
| Appendix 12 | List of individuals consulted |

APPENDIX 1 STRATEGIC CONTEXT

2007 was a significant time for this research into the African, Caribbean and Asian Visual Arts Sector in the West Midlands for a number of reasons. Notably, it is almost 20 years since the first external piece of research was produced by the Black Arts Forum, titled *History of the Study into Black Arts in Birmingham*. In addition, it is almost 15 years since the first internal report this the arts and Black and Minority Ethnic people was produced by Birmingham City Council's Arts Team in 1992, so it seems appropriate that the topic is re-visited now.

This was also the year in which Richard Hylton's *The Nature of the Beast* was published by the University of Bath. The book focused on cultural diversity policies, initiatives and attitudes in the UK's visual arts sector, between 1976 and 2006. It drew out key events, large scale initiatives such as *decibel* and provided a comprehensive critique of activity taking place. To this end it provided an extremely useful over-view of the subsidised visual arts sector.

The Nature of the Beast focuses almost solely on the public sector, particularly on the Arts Council, and engages to a much lesser extent with broader sociological perspectives, such as wider cultural theory, the current fascination with Islam or anti-globalisation/ globalisation. Finally and perhaps most crucially it did not consider movements taking place outside of the subsidised sector, such as the development of new commercial markets for contemporary art in India and China, and in this sense its focus is in some way disconnected from the realities of the contemporary world.

2006 was the year that Arts Council England launched its national Visual Arts Strategy *Turning Point*, a ten year strategy for the contemporary visual arts. The strategy outlined the needs of the visual arts sector and drew together findings from consultation and an independent review. *Turning Point* focused upon contemporary visual art and defined this as

“.... the art of our time. It is more a way of seeing than a defined art form; the practice is often interdisciplinary with a range of media including photography, new media, fine art, artists' moving image, live art, crafts, design and architecture. It is a driving force in popular culture, nurtured through creative innovation, entrepreneurial risk, new curatorial processes and critical debate. While the dictionary definition of 'modern' is synonymous with 'contemporary', in art the modern has a period – arguably 1860 to 1970 – a style and a theory which is both absorbed and contested by the plurality of contemporary art. This breadth gives rich opportunities for artists, audiences and organisations to respond to increasingly global contexts.¹”

¹ http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/aboutus/project_detail.php?browse=recent&id=516
accessed on Monday 16th July 2007

The focus on contemporary visual art is interesting and will be picked up further later on in this report. The review carried out for *Turning Point* was wide ranging and considered areas such as spaces, resources, production, presentation, workforce and continuing professional development in considering the needs of artists, audiences and participants.

Importantly, the plan positions itself within current Arts Council policy, its target is integrated planning and a core element is the desire to engage audiences within the broader visual arts sector. Five priority areas are identified:

- Audiences, participation and education
- Support for artists
- Innovation and risk
- Diversity and leadership
- Places, spaces, and partnerships

Interestingly, the strategy also identifies what it sees as likely outcomes. These are wide ranging and delivering on such targets, particularly within the African, Caribbean and Asian visual arts sector, will undoubtedly require innovation and risk taking on the part of stakeholders. The outcomes, as set out in *Turning Point*, will be picked up on in the findings as well as in recommendations within this report.

The developments and strategy within *Turning Point* must be contextualised alongside the findings of *Take Away the Label* (Morris Hargreaves McIntyre for Axis, 2005). This report identified a number of issues specifically pertaining to culturally diverse artists. It highlighted growing evidence that policies were increasingly out of touch with the experiences, needs and views of artists themselves. If ACEWM is to genuinely embed *Turning Point* into actions and policy within the West Midlands then it must connect on both micro and macro levels.

Regionally, the West Midlands has benefited from a specific decibel Visual Arts Officer post (nationally, the only one of its kind), running from June 2006 to March 2008. decibel identified three main objectives that remained integral to the visual arts officer post:

- Increasing respect and recognition for work by artists and organisations from the African, Asian and Caribbean sector
- Helping to empower British-based African, Asian and Caribbean artists and companies
- Promoting the acceptance of many voices

The focus then, was very clearly on artists and the production of work; an aim that will be picked up on later in this report.

The report must also be positioned within the lead up to the Olympic Games in 2012. Whilst the Cultural Olympiad provides a period for potential engagement and innovative partnerships, there is also a sense of concern, specifically in relation to lottery funding cuts of 35% and the impending comprehensive spending review.

The research findings must also be contextualised with an understanding of ACE's Race Equality Scheme which has now been running for several years. How were regularly funded organisations engaging with this initiative? How were targets being set and met? Did the findings identify increased engagement, production, representation or improved consumption?

Race Equality Scheme, RESPOND, Race Equality Action Plans

Respond was launched in 2005, with the aim of embedding 'race' equality and diversity into the wider arts led agenda. It sought to guide regularly funded organisations through the process of developing a race equality action plan. ACE required all RFO's to develop their REAPs and a considerable amount of training and investment accompanied this. Staff also received training and both diversity and decibel officers worked intensively with RFO's to ensure REAPs were applicable and deliverable. There were three key stages to the work, an organisational audit, development of the race equality action plan and following this developmental phase monitoring, reviewing and evaluating the plan.

Whilst a focus on audiences was not prioritised it would be prudent to consider large scale initiatives such as the 1998 – 2003 New Audiences Programme, which included 209 projects focussed on Black and minority ethnic issues. This is also particularly pressing given governmental pressures from DCMS to engage more effectively with BME audiences and people from social classes C2DE.

The findings should also be contextualised within the wider issue of the commercial markets. Market Matters examines the visual contemporary art movement, although it does not specifically pick up on the diversity of contemporary arts and focuses more on conceptual arts rather than the broader range of practices taking place in the UK. The report highlights that whilst Birmingham in the West Midlands has some of the infrastructural elements required to support a commercial arts sector it lacks

the full complement of components – inspirational art schools, an established community of artists, pro-actively collecting public galleries, informed critics, committed collectors – all of which need to come together at the same time to encourage the establishment of commercial galleries and to kick-start a viable market for challenging contemporary art. In short, for a commercial infrastructure to exist, there has to be a critical mass of all the essential elements. (2005: 49)

Finally, the European Commission has proposed 2008 as the *Year of Intercultural Dialogue* to promote interaction between the different cultures of Europe and to encourage a sense of shared belonging among all Europeans; this has, in part, come about due to a sense that the population of Europe is becoming increasingly polarised along ethnic lines.

APPENDIX 2

ACTION RESEARCH – MICRO PROJECTS AND ARTISTS’ FEEDBACK ON THE PROCESS

As part of the action research process, the artists developed small/ micro-projects as well as engaging in the full range of research processes described in Section 3.2 above. The projects were:

- Meetings with curators at BMAG to explore how local African, Asian and Caribbean artists could be better supported – reaching national or international markets through their work
- How to ask the right questions, how to determine these questions, how to sell creative development & thinking, how to continue to practice and explore issues that convince, when to know that the product is right for its audience whilst also accessible and intelligent.
- Ways of engaging arts organisations with arts & faith work particularly exploring raising the importance of this area of work, identifying spaces for discussion and interaction
- How to engage on a national level, taking steps towards developing a national profile by connecting with organisations such as Autograph
- How to market work that is culturally specific yet also potentially innovative, how to engage with schools and formal education, developing the culturally specific engagement beyond themes of ‘India’ and ‘RE’

Artists’ Feedback

The feedback from the artists on their engagement with the action research process overall was extremely positive:

This is one of the best experiences I’ve ever had; I’ve met professional artists and people, who’ve inspired me to move forward. The action research sessions were extremely useful. The final session where we

focused on my development was one of the most useful things I've ever done. I can now visualise my development. And we got paid for it!

It was really good to meet and work with fellow artists; we gave encouragement to each other and shared our frustrations and difficulties. The facilitators we trusted and believed they really took an interest and cared about the issues we were raising. It felt like we had a voice and also reassuring that ACE wanted to know about our experiences.

The debates were a good learning point that gave insights into the different perspectives of the people around the table. They equally inspired but also frustrated us at times when our worlds didn't meet. The action research has empowered me to look at my own difficulties and think creatively on how to address them. I feel excited that getting involved in this research can lead to my own work moving forward in a positive way.

It's been a really positive experience, the people that I've met, the quality of work that's out there. I really enjoyed speaking to the artists that I interviewed. It was good to meet someone with the experience and knowledge of Juginder, learning about what's happened before.

It was really good to be able to speak up at the critical dialogues; they confirmed what we already knew to be true. I feel enriched that I've met spent time with people like Juginder, Belinda and Samina. It was good to meet and spend time with the other action research artists too.

APPENDIX 3

NATIONAL POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK SUMMARY OF KEY LEGISLATION AND REPORTS

The main legislation relating to this field is as follows:

- The Equal Pay Act 1970
- The Employment Equality (Religion and Belief) Regulations 2003
- The Human Rights Act 1998
- The Race Relations Act 1976
- The Race Relations Amendment Act 2000
- Race Relations Act 1976 (Amendment) Regulations 2003

Race Relations Amendment Act (2000)

The Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 placed a legal obligation on all public bodies (in the region of 43, 000) to make 'race' equality central to their work. There were three parts to this:

- Eliminating unlawful discrimination.
- Promoting equal opportunities.
- Promoting good race relations.

The government also introduced Best Value Local Government Equality Standard and Public Service Agreement (PSA) targets to monitor and reduce 'race' inequalities between 2007 and 2008 and thereby improve services to minority ethnic communities.

Commission for Equality and Human Rights

Equalities laws have seen a major overhaul, particularly since 1997. This involved the incorporation of the European Human rights legislation in the Human Rights Act 1998 into UK law. 2007 saw the emergence of the Commission for Equality and Human Rights (CEHR) which will oversee equalities working in the areas of race, gender, sexuality, age, religion and disability. This drew together the three existing commissions for equal rights (the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE), the Disability Rights Commission (DRC) and the Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC).

The CEHR is to act as a leadership body for equalities and participate in the debate around human rights issues in all areas of UK society, aiming to create a 'culture of respect'. The CEHR is to have a particular focus on organisations and bodies that carry out public functions and services. The CEHR whilst already formally in existence will not be fully operational until October 2007. Following this period, the existing Commission for Racial Equality will be phased out over the following two years.

Local Government

Local authorities have a duty to create race equality schemes that prevent racial discrimination and ensure that all members of the public are able to access services. A number of local authority strategies and policies are relevant here, although it is not possible to consider them in any depth. These include the Local Strategic Partnerships, Local Area Agreements and Neighbourhood Renewal Programmes.

The Audit Commission: *Journey to Race Equality*

The Audit Commission's *Journey to Race Equality* is also useful in considering a range of critical success factors in regard to achieving successful race equality projects. These are:

- Clear vision, priorities and outcomes
- Committed leadership

- Developing organisational capacity (training and gathering information and knowledge of communities)
- Engagement with Black and minority ethnic communities and building relationships
- Internal culture and rationale – breaking patterns of behaviour and negativity
- Managing performance - monitoring or tracking schemes, not only creating them
- Working with other partners

This is a useful model for consideration in mapping the current layout within the West Midlands visual arts sector, in regard to race relations. Another non arts related tool is the *Public Sector Self-Assessment Tool* which seeks to facilitate organisational development, although as with many such tools the challenge lies in applying non-arts specific methods to the arts/ cultural sector.

Stephen Lawrence Enquiry & MacPherson Report

The Macpherson Report identified the presence and coined the term 'institutionalised racism' within public bodies. The report defined this as

The collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their colour, culture, or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amounts to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping which disadvantages Black and minority ethnic people

Legislative changes placed considerably greater responsibility upon public bodies and organisations. The Race Relations (Amendment) Act (2000) extended the powers of existing legislation to prohibit discrimination in all functions of public authorities, defining a public authority in its broadest sense – including the arts within this.

However, the act went further than simply legislating against racial discrimination; it placed responsibility upon all public facing organisations to actively promote 'race' equality. This requirement connected with organisations at every level, including for example staff recruitment, programming policies and training in relation to cultural sensitivity.

Improving Opportunity, Strengthening Society

The Government's 2005 report '*Improving Opportunity, Strengthening Society*' the Government's strategy to increase race equality and community cohesion, comments:

We also expect museums, galleries and community cultural programmes to play an increased role in promoting an understanding of, and celebrating, the diverse elements of our local and national society (2005: 14)

The report considered the following themes as vital to working towards community cohesion, namely that:

- extremists who promote hatred are marginalised
- immigrants are fully integrated and are seen as making a positive contribution
- people have opportunities to develop a greater understanding of the range of cultures that contribute to our strength as a country
- people from all backgrounds have opportunities to participate in civic society
- racism is unacceptable
- young people from all ethnic backgrounds grow up with a shared sense of belonging

Key recent developments in the area of cultural diversity

CONTEXT	PUBLICATIONS	KEY OUTCOMES
Legislative Changes	Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 European Race Directive (Article 13, Treaty of Amsterdam)	The Act strengthens and extends the 1976 Race Relations Act. It places on public authorities a new positive general duty to promote race equality and good race relations. It outlaws racial discrimination in any of the authority's functions. It covers the provision of goods, facilities and services, as well as employment. Forbids discriminations against religion or belief.
Stephen Lawrence Enquiry	MacPherson Report	Prompted a proliferation of race equality action plans covering HR, training and service delivery in the public Inquiry sector.
Socio-economic and demographic trends	Statistics	Rising numbers of minority ethnic people in the UK. In 2000/1 one person in 14 was from a minority ethnic community. The employment rate for all minority ethnic people has remained constant over the last few years. In 2000/01, unemployment among African/Caribbean and Pakistani/Bangladeshi was three times greater than for white people.
Government policy		Diversity is one of the six key themes in the civil service reform programme. The Home Office has set targets for the civil service within government departments and for service delivery on the part of public services. Consideration is being given to an 'equalities watchdog'.

Source: *Directions in Diversity, Audit Commission 2002.*

APPENDIX 4

OVERVIEW OF POLICY DOCUMENTS, STRATEGIC REPORTS AND CURRENT POLICY/ACTION PLANS IN THE WEST MIDLANDS, FROM 1988

The earliest paper was produced some twenty years ago, in December 1988 by the **Black Arts Forum**; it was titled *History of the Study into Black Arts in Birmingham* and as the title spells out focused specifically on Birmingham.

This report was followed, in January 1992, by **Birmingham City Council's** arts team. The paper sought to produce an **arts development strategy for Birmingham's minority ethnic communities**, drawing on the strengths of existing provision such as the Cave arts centre whilst also picking up on the lack of engagement by minority ethnic communities within mainstream arts provision. The report also recognised the lack of minority ethnic presence within the arts as a whole.

Also in 1992, **QNUN Consultants Ltd** were commissioned by **West Midlands Arts** to produce an **African Caribbean and Asian arts strategy**. In 1993 an African, Asian and Caribbean Action Plan was produced to develop actions in response to the suggestions made in the QNUN report.

The strategy and action plan clearly identified the need for greater understanding and awareness, prioritising the inter-relationship between art and culture, "If the art is to be understood, the cultures must be understood" (1992: 13).

The report recognised two themes for change. Firstly the huge shifts taking place within technology, economic and political shifts and changing social expectations. Secondly, it drew out a theme specific to Asian, Caribbean and African peoples, alongside other migrant communities, that of "the experience of moving from being 'immigrant' communities to 'indigenous' communities. (1992: 12). The report highlighted the fact that "from now, within one generation, the great majority will be born and bred Caribbean British, Asian British, Chinese British and so on." (1992: 12).

The strategy identified the shifts that were occurring between the fields of social deprivation, cultural deprivation and institutionalised racism. It also highlighted three key themes of engagement bought about as immigrant communities shifted to 'indigenous' communities, the change in white British organisations from dealing with Asian, Caribbean and African people as external to themselves to looking internally at their own practices of engagement and finally the increasing visibility of Asian, African and Caribbean people.

The strategy was developed around the following themes:

Arts and Communities

Pulling together the feedback of diverse community groups – which researchers found to be ‘unnervingly similar’

Arts and Artists

The concerns of practitioners both generally and in relation to WMA – as well as WMA capacity and ability to deal with these concerns

This section picked up on areas such as recognition, representation, funding or viability and the right to make mistakes, evaluation, leadership and the cumulative impact of Asian, Caribbean and African arts development

Arts and Partnerships

Partnership approaches with organisations such as Government, local government, education and business.

The extremely comprehensive strategy and action plan by QNUN was followed up by the **South Asian Contemporary Visual Arts Report** produced by **Juginder Lamba** in 1994. This report accompanied a region wide festival of contemporary South Asian visual arts, which was supported by West Midlands Arts. It was produced as part of the evaluation for the festival.

Reaching Out Making Connections was also produced in 1995. The publication was researched and edited by **Bob Ramdhanie for WMA and Birmingham City Council**. It highlighted African, Asian and Caribbean artists and arts organisations practising in the region.

In 1995 an implementation schedule was produced to run from 1995 to 1997 which set out a framework through which objectives and outcomes could be monitored, it is unclear from the data available whether these were monitored or the associated level of success.

In 1998, **Alan Dix** worked with **Sandwell Arts** to produce a detailed report on **South Asian Arts in Sandwell** alongside a Development Plan for the town. In 1999 a review of this document was carried out with support from **Indigo Consultants**.

Birmingham City Council’s Arts Team, together with a cross section of arts organisations produced a comprehensive **Visual Arts Strategy in 2000/01**, although this was not specifically focused upon the needs of Asian, African, Caribbean artists or communities.

The newly established **Birmingham Race Action Partnership (b:RAP)** published *Black City White Mask* in 2001. The report explored issues of ‘race’, racism and the cultural services in Birmingham in order to stimulate debate, discussion and change in the way in which cultural services were provided in the city. The research identified considerable frustration but it also stressed the

drum as symbolic of the state and of the sector, “fitted into the Black venue box, under funded, working in a difficult geographical and socio-economic area and lacking the support that it required” (2001: 28).

West Midlands Arts produced an internal **Cultural Diversity Vision Statement** in 2000. This provided the basis for the subsequent ***Shifting Perspectives*** action plan compiled in 2002 which ran until 2006, governing the work of Arts Council England West Midlands office as it took over from the West Midlands Regional Arts Board (WMA). The draft vision document acknowledged that a “hierarchy persists that ensures that some cultures can confer status to certain communities and cultures, whilst others are excluded.” (WMA, 2000) Key fields of negotiation utilised within the vision statement were:

- Infrastructure
- Networks
- Funding
- Monitoring & Evaluation
- Partnerships & Advocacy
- Professional Development & Training

In summer 2001 **Craftspace and Sampad** researched the potential for a joint ***South Asian Crafts Development Strategy***. The research focused on three key areas, namely professional development, cross-cultural backgrounds/ cross art form and access.

The most recent externally produced report was produced, in 2002, by **Screen West Midlands**, entitled ***Cultural Diversity Research Programme***.

APPENDIX 5

DEFINITIONS – AFRICAN, CARIBBEAN AND ASIAN – FURTHER EXPLORATION

There is a tension between contemporary understanding and use of the specific ethnic categorisations and the more inclusive definition of cultural diversity.

For example, a gallery can address cultural diversity by engaging with the considerable amount of work taking place that connects to understandings of internationalism and globalisation theory, without connecting this work to the development of Asian, African and Caribbean artists within its locality. To give an example of interesting practice where the global and local connection has been made effectively, the Coventry Arts Alive Festival run by the Belgrade Theatre during the 1990’s consciously nurtured strong relationships between the international artists who featured in the festival’s programme and local theatre companies in Coventry. This meant that artists benefited from the opportunity to

widen their horizons, and their artistic practice benefited from new influences and new collaborations.

There is a danger that if we work solely within the wide umbrella of cultural diversity, we lift identity and ethnicity so far from their starting points that we lose sight of the original aims under which the rationale for collective groupings originally worked. These sought to combat cultural racism, prejudice and ways of seeing that always positioned non-white as relational, as marginal to white. As Manick Govinda commented in the on line *Spiked* debate

Arts institutions and funders over the years dropped any anti-racist code of practice, if indeed they ever had one, and replaced it with the more liberal cultural diversity action plans. Cultural diversity is much more acceptable - it embraces the fact that we live in a diverse society and is a cause to be celebrated. However, what cultural diversity has done is to dismiss the term Black Arts - a holistic term that united artists of African, Asian and Caribbean descent through their common experience of colonialism and their struggles against it - and so ethnicising and fragmenting communities by focusing on difference.

The embracement of cultural diversity may be a cause for concern, however, because it lacks an analysis of the social and historical forces that determine and shape racism. I also think that it alienates white people, since the strategies seem to give preferential treatment to 'ethnic minorities'. This is not the way to win the white majority over. Thorough reasoning needs to be given for any positive action programme, which means giving the public an analysis of racism and the roots of racism. Otherwise, many people may think (although they may not say it) that preferential treatment is being given to 'ethnic minorities'.

However, the thinking behind the use of the term 'cultural diversity' was to pick up on and recognise work being developed by the European Union and to develop an inclusive approach in relation to broader cultural diversity issues, picking up for example on disability, gender, sexuality and class. These are not areas that this research specifically picks up on, however they are all touched on through an acknowledgement of intersectionality.

As a side note, the research for *Take Away the Label* (op cit) was slightly diluted as it did not focus solely upon Asian, African or Caribbean artists. Rather it drew upon the experiences of a cross section of minority positions, including the experiences of those who "felt that their cultural background made them a minority", for example an English artist living in Scotland, or Wales, although this was a small percentage (10%).

Such an approach calls into question the manner in which a cultural hierarchy exists which challenges the engagement of African, Asian and Caribbean artists

from a particular axis of power based on specific understandings of culture, ethnicity, integration and assimilation. This is not the experience of many white artists although that is not to say that there are not other axes of power which are equally and continuously at play, e.g. class, gender, disability, etc.

An awareness of this drew us to the term 'intersectionality' (Phoenix & Pattynama, 2006). This term refers to the interplay between multiple connections and multiple identifications. Phoenix & Pattynama highlight how intersectionality stresses social positions as relational, making "visible the multiple positioning that constitutes everyday life and the power relations that are central to it" (2006: 187). It was an exploration of how power relations attributed or withheld value that led us to research the field of values and difference.

APPENDIX 6 VALUE AND DIFFERENCE

The action research dialogue was critical in gaining an insight into values and difference. We asked the question 'How is Difference valued?' In responding we crossed a plethora of themes and the points raised below form part of the concepts touched on as part of the discussions.

The dialogue in the critical debate undertaken as part of this research on values and difference began with an example of the challenges being faced in culturally sensitive programming. This concerned a specific women only evening event, during a four week exhibition. The event was filled to capacity but encountered numerous challenges in its co-ordination by Ulfah Arts, an organisation that develops work within faith and the arts. This included questions to the local council and negative media coverage.

For others present at the critical dialogue session this example highlighted the "*challenge in the establishment*", "*it's about difference in people who set the stakes*" but it was also evidence which demonstrated that this was the right work to focus upon.

The issue of difference began with the almost random use of selected categorisations within forms and definitions, those present questioned the use of 'tick boxes', "*when you can tick the boxes, are you African, black, what does it matter? What does it mean? You know what I mean? It doesn't mean anything.*"

It was also recognised that work engaging with Asian, African and Caribbean artists and communities was seen as outreach, as "*supplementary to the work of the organisation*". This went to the heart of the debate question, "*difference is defined by difference from what they [the establishment] define themselves as and what provision there isn't.*"

The curators present also recognised that difference could be exoticised; *“if your art was good and people were interested in it, I think you would probably get further not with a name that was John Smith” ... “you provide a brand then that adds an extra idea of difference.”*

They also highlighted a potential area for future growth, *“the idea of the institution taking on difference as a branding strategy rather than as a policy strategy, rather as a kind of integrated part of how they act”* was seen as a unique selling point.

There are two particular issues here; firstly that difference is seen as exotic and secondly that difference is seen as additional to organisations' mainstream programmes; it's the supplementary work of organisations rather than part of their core programme.

The Arts Council were aware that whilst change might be identified they were also constrained by existing policies, and addressing certain priorities, *“we're always being governed by this wider agenda, and I'd say that the politics of popularising up, diversifying things, even more so, its becoming even more urgent because its all about audience”*.

These concerns were encapsulated in the comments made, namely that *“the establishment is whom would take bad practice over good practice if it means keeping the status quo and the status quo might be who makes the decisions in choosing what exhibitions and what artists the gallery shows ... they take on and play with exoticism.”*

In considering the concept of mainstream the group considered the manner in which cultural provision 'should be for everyone'. This notion was positioned within the challenge of acknowledging the needs of particular groups with the seeming juxtaposition of art being accessible to everyone; *“when you start saying it's specific or it's a particular interest to groups, that's when I think you start bumping up against these problems where people say ‘we think it should be accessible for everybody’”*.

The issue of shaping cultural provision in order to both acknowledge the cultural sensitivities of specific groupings whilst also recognising inclusive audience engagement was opened out. The issues covered drew out, on a micro level, the challenges facing a multicultural society; how can cultures co-exist together; how can arts provision be open to all.

The group also focused on the role played by value and how notions of value operated within arts provision, as commented *“there is a definite difference in terms of how people view work that takes place, if it's being shown in a local community to taking that same piece of work, putting it in a gallery or a white cube space, people look at it totally different. The value immediately shoots up.”*

The challenge inherent within notions of value is the basis on which this is allocated. Is value tied in, for example, with quality and how is quality determined. As Araeen writes in *Spiked* we face a challenge

(when) there is no common framework or criteria by which all artistic production, irrespective of its ethnic or cultural roots, is recognised and evaluated. In fact, this lack of common framework and criteria is not only the root of racism but is deeply entrenched in the ideology of our liberal system. If racism is something that should be abhorrent to a liberal society and what it stands for in terms of human equity, how do we explain this contradiction?

Working with such thinking helped to shape the research parameters, it also drew out issues such as the lack of a common framework for *all* arts and creative practice, in addition to how systematic change needs to take place within the existing cultural frameworks.

Araeen's point was picked up in the Critical Dialogue session run as part of this research, specifically the complexities of identifying and 'knowing' good work:

"It's hard to define what it [good work] is but I think everybody knows when you stand in front of something"

"... Somebody has to make a judgement call about what you put on walls...."

"... It is very much down to the individual but I think if you took a series of subjective things you would start to think people are going to look at one thing and another thing and go well that, you're not doing it and, that, even if I don't like it, has got something about it,....."

"... But really, as a curator, your role is to nurture your subjectivity to a point at which people can trust your subjectivity

So that you see objectivity even whilst knowing its subjective?"

We see here how familiarity plays an important role in the decisions that are made in relation to quality. One builds up an impression or understanding of quality based on 'a series of subjective things'. This becomes problematic if these are all specific to one genre, or representative of specific cultural forms, the process quickly becomes a repetitive cycle where often the only variable is the surrounding space.

This also led to a point in the discussion when the dynamic between good work and quality or important work that affected change was drawn out.

So as curators you have this subjectivity, but there is a difference between good work and if we're talking about quality I am trying to work out what you mean by quality and important work. Now, for me, it's a whole different world because art can look great on the walls, people respond to it ... but what about work that affects change?

What was particularly interesting within the debate was the shift in focus that took place when we started to talk about important work that effected change. This work wasn't seen to be held within curated spaces, white cube galleries or even diverse site specific work. This work was felt to be channelled through the work of 'community artists'.

that's where the community artists would come into it because they are, there is you can't see the finish of the product but ... you know you are actually working with the community, with the people, with the normal people as an artist to make that difference and for us that is a fantastic artist.

This feeling was also reflected in the findings from the one to one interviews with artists where artists often felt that they needed to choose between community engaged practice and the "mainstream" professional routes that were open to them.

It was within this discursive space that we began to see implicit challenges in the work and how artists are forced to choose between being valued and carrying out 'important work'. The experience of a curator highlighted the thinking that may take place behind the decision making process

I got some money to get a series of artists to work and the assessor was going "well, you don't really want community artists" and "we don't want anyone with the reputation of being a community artist"; and so I said to her, "well, what do you mean by community artist?" She said, "well, you know, someone who's got a reputation of you know, not being a serious artist, someone who works in the community". So there is somewhere this distinction now between people who are the great who stand on our monuments and chisel in their hand and these people who are doing, as you say, who are doing that good work in our community

These different spheres were acknowledged but they were also challenged "*the interesting territory is not to accept those two categories basically and is to actually cross those worlds, that's where it starts getting interesting really.*" Yet, it was also acknowledged that the power relations work in a single direction, "*it's much easier to go from the white cube into the community than for the community to*".

In part this is due to the spaces available but it also connects with the thinking of Araeen outlined above. The challenge for artists was that whilst a level of success might be found within community arts practice this recognition was far harder to achieve in *“the white cube and the community arts kind of thing because a lot of them are working as artists and community artists as well, that cross over is quite strong but the money, or the recognition, as an artist, isn’t always there, but as a community artist they are very successful.”*

The research also highlighted the difficulties faced by artists working within the community sector in breaking into other sectors. Ranbir Kaur is an unusual example of an artist who has carried out large scale commissions (in rangoli) at Womad, Jaguar and elsewhere, and has also worked extensively in community settings with arts such as textiles, mehndi, and other crafts based practice.

Craftspace highlighted the challenge in finding spaces which enabled it to show the work of both artists who have an independent practice and artists working within the community. Deirdre Figueiredo, Craftspace’s Director, stressed the importance of acknowledging that social enterprise is as important as community engagement and professionalism. Stressing however that one must also recognise that the market place cannot support a large number of high end makers.

In thinking of solutions, the artists present drew on themselves and highlighted how useful the critical debates had been to them.

“We’re sitting here asking these questions. How can we be helped? Maybe the answers are inside of ourselves. Maybe the answers are just a matter of, OK, we’re listening here, we’re taking notes. What is it we can find as a direction. Maybe, as artists, we’ve become so soft, so pampered, in a sense, that we lack the drive and the initiative to move our own careers forward. Maybe that’s the point. ... I remember political movements in the seventies and eighties and the nineties”

However, whilst it was important for artists to recognise their own empowerment and to identify courses for action, it was also the role – and duty – of all organisations and individuals to take this on board. Organisations also need to *“take into consideration race and how that fits into and permeates through their structures. It’s about them taking responsibility from the top, right down to the front of the house. Everybody has to take that responsibility on.”*

APPENDIX 7

REGIONAL GALLERIES' ENGAGEMENT WITH AFRICAN CARIBBEAN AND ASIAN VISUAL ARTS, AND WORK BY INDIVIDUAL CURATORS

Regional Galleries

Birmingham's arts centre, the *mac*, has long held an important role as a venue that regularly exhibits work by Asian, African and Caribbean artists, both international and regional (in recent years about 25% of the programme, i.e. more than 50 regional and national Asian, African and Caribbean artists). The *mac* is hosting one of the decibel funded curatorial traineeships (see below).

Birmingham Museum and Art Gallery (incidentally led by a Black director, one of the first in the UK), is placing an increasing emphasis on the development of exhibition projects in partnership with community groups, particularly African, Caribbean and Asian, in order to shift the ownership of the programme from the museum to participants and audience. It is also planning to open a new gallery that will focus specifically on representing local and regional Asian, African and Caribbean artist.

Birmingham is also hoping to be able to develop its collections policy to focus on contemporary work, to include work by artists from Africa and Asia. This could come about if their joint bid with Ikon and New Art Gallery, Walsall to the Art Fund International succeeds. The Art Fund has committed £5 million to this new initiative, to develop collections of international contemporary art in UK regional museums and galleries. This would be a significant development, and it would be interesting to learn from a gallery such as Cartwright Hall in Bradford, which took up a strong focus on collecting contemporary Asian art during the 1990's.

Both the Ikon and Mead (Warwick Arts Centre) galleries play a significant function in bringing work by international artists to the West Midlands region, including a number from Asia, Africa and the Caribbean. Both galleries have included regional artists in their programmes, including a couple of regional Asian, African and Caribbean artists, but regional work does not form a major priority within their programme. However it would be useful to build on the international strengths of their programmes to benefit regional Asian, African and Caribbean artists with opportunities to learn about and potentially form links with international and major UK artists. Both galleries have significant education programmes which include strands that engage directly with Asian, African and Caribbean communities, Ikon has an offsite programme, including Ikon EastSide which is used as a temporary space to develop relationships between art, artists and audiences.

Wolverhampton Art Gallery was cited by many people we spoke to as a good example of a gallery that is strongly committed to cultural diversity. Its

developing policy is to represent as broad a cross-cultural spectrum as possible in its programme and collections, through the exploration of different issues rather than focusing on particular ethnic groups. For example, it seeks to address issues of cultural and social inclusion through work with the local Primary Care Trust and has expanded its Second World War veteran's archive to include the experiences of African, Caribbean and Asian Commonwealth veterans. In this way, the gallery believes it can reach a broader cultural audience and target African, Caribbean and Asian people more effectively and meaningfully and with a less 'segregational' approach. As part of this strategy, it has formed an African Caribbean Panel, made up of members of the community, to advise on the development of exhibitions. The gallery is also working with University of Wolverhampton and other organisations, including Birmingham-based Collide, to develop new opportunities for African, Caribbean and Asian audiences to engage with the programme.

In the past 3 years, Wolverhampton Art Gallery has shown work by over 44 African, Caribbean and Asian artists and, as part of the Museums Association's Diversify scheme, it has hosted 3 trainee curators and 1 exhibitions officer. Artists shown are regional, national and international, and there has been an interesting focus on craft at the Bilston Art Gallery site, including mehndi and carnival.

The New Art Gallery in Walsall also places a strong priority on cultural diversity. This is demonstrated in many ways – through the collection policy, the exhibition programme, residencies and internships. The collection policy has actively sought out work by artists from cultural groups currently under-represented in the collections, and has recently bought work by Asian, African and Caribbean artists. This may increase if the Art Fund International application described above (under Birmingham Museum Art Gallery) is successful. The residency programme provides support for 3 young artists each year, one of whom is Asian African or Caribbean, providing studio space, a bursary fee and the possibility of an exhibition at the gallery. The internship programme has a priority for involving Asian, African and Caribbean artists/curators, and it is intended to develop an ongoing support programme for interns after they move on. The exhibitions programme has included 50 Asian, African and Caribbean artists over the past 3 years, including 2 from the region.

In Coventry, a range of local authority arts and media services have been brought together under the umbrella of the Herbert. This includes the exhibition and museum function, the arts development team, and Herbert Media, a resource providing access to music and media equipment and training (previously known as the Depot). This allows for a potentially strong cross-fertilisation of support, as the arts development service supports an artists' group and a Black Arts Forum, thus linking individuals closely into the local authority arts infrastructure.

The Higher Education sector in the region supports various galleries. A significant new project that will be opening in late 2008 is Eastside Projects in Birmingham, a collaboration between the University of Central England (UCE) and Arts Council England. The tender to manage it was won by Gavin Wade, a researcher at UCE and independent curator from the region. This could be an important space, as it aims to become a more sustainable version of the “artist led project”, of which a number have developed in Birmingham over the past 5 years. UCE also has a gallery space at Bourneville School of Art, which has shown some work by UK Asian, African and Caribbean artists, and plans to develop more extensive relationships with regional Asian, African and Caribbean artists.

Examples of work by individual curators in the West Midlands region.

Two examples of work managed by individual curators are given, to demonstrate their significance and the way in which such projects can encompass a range of approaches:

- ***Under a New Sky:*** a project managed by Liz Rowe and curated by Peter Lewis (London) and Maurizio Bortolotti (Milan): this project commissioned 8 artists both international and UK based, some from Muslim backgrounds. Phase 1 was presented at Nachurel Records in Ladypool Road, a predominantly Muslim area, with the opening taking place to coincide with the commemoration event for the tornado that hit the area in October 2005. This initial exhibition introduced the background of the artists, their work, and preliminary ideas and models for related works. An important aspect of the project was to offer training opportunities and teaching to local 16-25 year olds.
- ***Sugar Coated Tears:*** a project involving the photographer and visual artist Vanley Burke, aiming to explore the links and connections between the industrial and commercial gains of slavery against the psychological and physical impact of items produced in the West Midlands. Sarah Blackstock worked on this project, in partnership with artists and community groups, with Wolverhampton Art Gallery and Blue Tycoon.

APPENDIX 8 ACCESS TO HIGHER EDUCATION IN ART AND DESIGN

- To increase understanding, in partnership with HEFCE, HEIs and arts organisations, of participation in the full range of creative arts courses by people from the most socially disadvantaged backgrounds.
- To work in partnership with HEIs, schools and local authorities to ensure that Aimhigher schemes for widening participation target young people from ethnic

minority backgrounds and those who are disabled to encourage them to study the arts.

- Through a limited number of pilot schemes, Arts Council England will work with selected HEIs and the Equality Challenge Unit to promote race equality schemes that increase recruitment of students and staff from ethnic minority backgrounds and develop culturally diverse arts courses and course content.
- For CHEAD to continue to fund transition into work and CPD (continuing professional development) schemes that help disabled artists and artists and arts managers from ethnic minority backgrounds to work successfully as arts professionals.

APPENDIX 9 CASE STUDIES

CASE STUDY 1: CREATIVE ADVISERS SCHEME, ARTS COUNCIL SOUTH WEST

The aim of the Creative Advisers Scheme (CAS) is to build the capacity of Black and minority ethnic artists and arts organisations in the South West, through this it seeks to promote and profile work and develop audiences. The scheme ran from 2003 until 2007.

The scheme targeted good quality South West based BME artists and arts organisations. This included those who had:

- demonstrated the quality of their work
- been paid for doing this work
- the desire and ambition to get their work seen by more people

The scheme did not require artists to cover work that only related to specific cultural or ethnic identifications although artists could include this dimension in their work. The scheme sought to challenge narrow definitions and understandings of artists. It required artists to be in a position to reflect on their practice and come with ideas and commitment for their development.

Creative advisers were contracted to facilitate artists and arts professionals learning. This involved

- Identifying realistic objectives and outcomes;
- Developing a work plan
- Programming a period of relevant activity
- Setting a timeline with appropriate meeting points
- Providing on-going, up to date advice and support
- Documenting their time on the programme

- Supporting any funding strategies
- Agreeing an exit strategy and evaluating the artists experience on the scheme

Artists were asked to complete a short application, which was then followed up with a Developmental Needs Analysis. General advice was also provided at this stage. Following the DNA, artists were selected to join the scheme and the information provided as part of the DNA utilised to identify potential advisers. In order to assess the suitability of the applicant, decisions were framed through the following questions

- Is this the right time and is the artist at the right place to benefit from a Creative Adviser?
- Is there evidence that shows that the artist is prepared to carry out the work and accept the advice provided by their creative adviser?
- Is working with a creative adviser the best solution to the issues identified by the artist or would another route be preferable?

CASE STUDY 2: ARNOLFINI, ARTS COUNCIL SOUTH WEST

Case study and interview with Tom Trevor, Director

Founded in 1961, Arnolfini is one of Europe's leading centres for the contemporary arts, programming exhibitions, live art & dance, sound/music, film, literature, talks and educational activities.

With the appointment of a new director in 2005, and as a consequence of his new 'Social Space' strategy, Arnolfini is developing a greater emphasis upon diversity and recognition of the post-colonial increasingly globalised conditions of cultural production.

In the director's words, the new 'Social Space' strategy focuses on Arnolfini as

a space for ideas. Through a mixed arts programme, it provides a platform for experimentation across the disciplines and for emergent practice of international significance. It is a space for dialogue, enabling artists and audiences to engage in critical debate around issues of contemporary culture, interrogating dominant values and assumptions. At the same time, it is a space for contemplation, allowing room for personal reflection, as well as reflection upon our own individual relationship to wider social conventions and events. As well as ideas, it is a space for subjective felt experience; a space for pleasure, for desire, and for strong emotions. It is therefore also a space to examine how 'my' experience is translated and re-presented in the wider world and, as such, inherently political, concerned with social justice and resistance to the unequal

distribution of power in society. It is a space for making meaning, a social space, and, thus, a force for change

A new Curator of Exhibitions, Nav Haq, a British Asian, will start in post in August 2007. Nav was previously curator at Gasworks, London; is curating the 2007 Contour Biennial for Video Art, Belgium, developing an ongoing exhibition/research project 'Lapdogs of the Bourgeoisie' investigating class hegemony in contemporary art (with partners including Platform Garanti, Istanbul and Townhouse Gallery, Cairo), and contributes regularly to 'Yishu', an international journal of contemporary Chinese art and culture, and 'Bidoun', a journal of Middle east arts and culture.

Nav and the director are planning an ambitious programme of projects that are not only located in the exhibition spaces, but also in different sites and social contexts in Bristol, inviting artists to develop exhibitions that are critically engaged with both the institution and with different audiences. In this way, Arnolfini will aim to create stronger connections with the surrounding city, whilst also reflecting upon what it means to be an internationally focused centre for contemporary arts today.

Since 2005 (Arnolfini was closed prior to this for a capital redevelopment), in terms of work by African, Caribbean and Asian visual artists, not including the live/dance programme, significant projects have included:

- 'The Ghosts of Songs', the first retrospective of the Black Audio Film Collective, curated and produced by the Otolith Group (Kodwo Eshun and Anjalika Saga). The 7 person collective is widely acknowledged as one of the most influential artists groups to emerge from Britain in recent years. From their base in East London, they produced experimental award winning film, photography, slide tape, video, installation, posters and interventions.
- 'The Black Moving Cube: Black Figuration & The Moving Image', involving Inge Blackman, Kole Onil-Ere, John Sealey and Kaz Ove, a major international touring programme presenting key works made by black artists working in the moving image, in collaboration with curator David A. Bailey and decibel
- 'Recording Iraq', involving 200 hours of unedited footage shot by Iraqis during the coalition invasion
- The upcoming 'Port City: on migration and exchange' (2007), which involve 17 African, Caribbean and Asian international artists (of which 3 are Bristol-based and 13 have been commissioned to produce new work), out of the 35 artists included in the project. They are: Mary Evans (British Nigerian), Meshac Gaba (Benin), Raimi Gbadamosi (British Nigerian), Kayle Brandon (British Caribbean), William Pope L (African American), Marvin Rees (British Caribbean), Maria Magdalena Campos Pons (Cuban), Maria Therese Alvez (Brazil), Zineb Sedira

(British Algerian), Doa Aly (Egyptian), Hala Elkoussy (Egyptian), Roza Ilgin (British Kurdish), Qasim Riza Shaheen (British Asian), Jiva Parthipan (British Asian), Hetain Patel (British Asian), Shi Ker (British Asian), Harminder Singh Judge (British Asian).

'Port City' has received a grant of £136,00 from Arts Council England. It will tour to John Hansard Gallery, Southampton and the 2008 Liverpool Biennial.

- The director is also curating 'The Far West' (2008), with Lu Jie, director of Long March, Beijing, in association with Zhang Wei, director of Vitamin Arts Space, Guangzhou, China.

This project will unpack parallel perceptions of the 'other' in terms of East and West, exploring how such projections of difference, and also direct cultural links, are embodied in the 'local'. The exhibition and out of the gallery projects will involve British Asian, international Asian and British artists.

In 2007/08, Arnolfini is funded by Arts Council England (£980,000), and Bristol City Council (£25,000).

CASE STUDY 3: SHISHA, ARTS COUNCIL NORTH WEST

The international agency for contemporary South Asian crafts and visual arts

Shisha's mission is to ensure that South Asian artists enjoy maximum support and opportunities through commissioning new work, residencies, exhibitions and publications.

There are few curators or producers of Asian origin in the West Midlands. This has a knock on effect in terms of the availability of product or exhibitions of Asian work. The research tells us that there is a substantial demand for support in this area so it's interesting to explore models such as that delivered by Shisha.

Shisha emerged from the Spirit Festival and Commonwealth Games in the North West. Based in Manchester the organisation partners museums and galleries to address issues of social exclusion and to diversify programmes and audiences.

The organisation works on the basis that work could be better represented within existing/ mainline programmes. It seeks to challenge existing representation through the provision of a range of advice and specialist support.

Shisha considers prejudice to exist for artists of South Asian descent, although they do not see this as being present only in museums or galleries but also within society as a whole. The organisation's website comments that work

can be exoticised, it is often perceived as or inappropriately linked to community arts or seen as being restricted to particular religious groups. There is a lack of awareness of the diversity of South Asian cultures and the broad range of work across generations and the international diaspora. People may falsely assume that the work will only appeal to South Asian audiences, and policy makers sometimes see the work as demonstrating their commitment to Asian arts in a tokenist way without providing for long term strategic support

Shisha challenges such thinking by providing a package of services. This includes exhibition curation, international connections and visits, on-going educational programmes and enabling connections with new audiences; diversifying agencies.

Shisha strives to provide curators with a sense of activity beyond the UK, encouraging engagement on an international level whilst contextualising this within the UK social framework (such as with the rise of Islamophobia). The company responds to the changing cultural climate within the UK and sees this as a vital aim in today's changing times.

Parampara is part of Shisha's on-going programme of work which supports the professional development of South Asian artists and curators in Greater Manchester through a series of solo exhibitions.

As part of the Parampara, Shisha recently engaged with refugee communities, in partnership with artist Yasmin Yaqub, also projects manager at Community Arts North West. The exhibition, entitled 'Refuge' explored testimonies of a lost home and resulted in a comprehensive archive including a publication.

Partnership is seen as vital and whilst engagement can be challenging it can also enable both artist and curatorial development as artists are encouraged to challenge their own thinking and development.

Shisha actively supports artists who are experimenting with their creativity – as well as dealing with challenges associated with identity. It is therefore unsurprising that the projects developed by Shisha are frequently at the cutting edge of both social and artistic practice.

They also aim to provide positive role models for artists, curators and arts professionals. The company's Director and Deputy Director both have backgrounds as artists and curators.

A particular focus for Shisha is the crossover and interchange between what are categorised in the UK as fine art and crafts, since in other lands these distinctions are less delineated.

Shisha remains interested in working with facilities that can increase diversity within collections, such as the Contemporary Arts Society, museums and galleries to provide strong archives that include the work of Asian artists.

All projects have a strong audience element and encourage participation through practical workshops or through education and outreach in innovative arts practice.

CASE STUDY 4: InIVA, The Institute of International Visual Arts, London, Case study and interview with Shreela Ghosh, Deputy Director

Since it was established in 1994, the London-based agency inIVA has developed and produced diverse and ground-breaking projects designed to bring the work of artists from culturally diverse backgrounds to the attention of the widest possible public.

In 2001, it was awarded a 'Breakthrough Programme Award' by the Arts Council of England for 'its pioneering and inspiring work with culturally diverse artists'.

The artists involved in the programme have, with a few exceptions, been primarily African, Caribbean and Asian, British and international artists who have been commissioned to make new work across a range of media.

InIVA collaborates with partner venues in the UK and worldwide although over the past 3 years, it has not collaborated with any West Midlands-based organisations, or included any West Midlands-based artists in its programme. More than 3 years ago, InIVA did organise a one man exhibition on Avtarjeet Dhanjal, who is based in Shropshire, and the exhibition *The Veil* toured to the New Art Gallery Walsall.

However, inIVA online, the digital archive, and the x-space, inIVA's virtual gallery, where young artists experiment with making digital artworks, supported by professional web designers, provide an invaluable resource to artists, curators and critics on cross-cultural aspects of the visual arts in a wider perspective.

InIVA's other activities include exhibitions, including for its project space, the ongoing Artists' Research Programme; publications, art education, research projects and resources; and the library. inIVA's programme of exhibitions and talks features artists and thinkers who explore the creative possibilities provided by the constant interaction of cultures in the contemporary world.

InIVA is now at a point of change, with its last director, Gus Casely-Hayford, in post for 6 months before going on to the Arts Council, and a new director about to be appointed.

Due to open in summer 2007, Rivington Place, London, will be the new home for inIVA and Autograph ABP. InIVA and Autograph ABP are dedicated to work from different cultural backgrounds and are part of larger history of the 'Diaspora visual arts' in Britain. Rivington Place is envisaged as one of the key resources from which this major but neglected story of the contemporary arts can be researched, debated and constructed.

Rivington Place is supported by the Arts Council England Lottery capital 2 Programme, Barclays Bank plc who have contributed £1million towards the development, as well as London Development Agency, City Fringe Partnership, ERDF, Hackney Council and Bridge House Trust.

Since it was established, key inIVA projects have included:

- the ongoing Artists' Research Programme, bringing artists into contact with industries through a number of residencies
- Beyond the Fantastic, an anthology of Latin American art criticism
- Reading the Contemporary, an anthology of writings on contemporary African art
- the exhibition and publication Boxer which explored boxing and visual art in relation to popular culture
- The Visible and Invisible - a multi-site exhibition in Euston, London that looked at the ways in which artists dealt with the human body, featuring newly-commissioned works by Louis Bourgeois, Virginia Nimarkoh, Donald Rodney and Doris Salcedo among others
- Mirage: Enigmas of Race, Difference and Desire - a collaboration with the ICA, London, that traced the influence of Frantz Fanon in the work of, among others, Sonia Boyce, Isaac Julien, Renée Green, Glenn Ligon and Steve McQueen
- Parisien(ne)s - an exhibition at Camden Arts Centre exploring notions of location and dislocation through the work of nine artists living and working in Paris including Thomas Hirshhorn, Huang Yong Ping, Shen Yuan and Chen Zhen
- A Fruitful Incoherence, a two-year research project on artists in Europe which culminated in a major publication; a striking multimedia exhibition - Relocating the Remains - at the Royal College of Art, London, of one of Britain's leading artists using new media, Keith Piper
- Simon Tegala's Anabiosis, a public artwork sited in the vast showroom window of Concord Sylvania, Central London
- Yinka Shonibare's celebrated Diary of Victorian Dandy series of staged colour photographs
- Major retrospectives of the works of Avtarjeet Dhanjal; Li Yuan-chia and Aubrey Williams
- The launch of inIVA OnLine which has enabled many artists to create new artworks for the Internet
- The x-space is inIVA's virtual gallery (www.iniva.org/xspace)

- Cutting-edge art education projects and resources including the five-year Schools Programme at Acland Burghley School documented in the Joining the Dots website (www.joiningthedots.org); DARE - Digital Art Resource for Education- (www.dareonline.org) produced in collaboration with Middlesex University and artist Mary Evans' *Filter* CD-ROM for primary schools.

InIVA's current core grant from Arts Council England is in region of £800,000.

www.iniva.org

APPENDIX 9

ANALYSIS OF FACT FINDING AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT INFORMATION FROM ARTISTS' SURVEY

This analysis is based on returns from 33 artists have completed one to one interviews with either the action researchers or with Hybrid. This list includes the research artists themselves.

A standard format was used across all the interviews, including Part A, a fact finding and professional development survey, and Part B, covering general issues. This analysis includes only the quantitative information given in Part A. Information from Part B has been incorporated within the main body of the research report.

ANALYSIS OF PART A – FACT FINDING AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT SURVEY

Location

Location	
Birmingham	21
Coventry	2
Redditch	1
Shropshire	1
Stoke	1
Walsall	1
Wolverhampton	2
London	1
Total	30

Compiling the list of artists was not straightforward as there appears to be no systematic listing that identifies BME artists. The list was compiled using personal contacts of the researchers and action research artists. As the initial list proved to be largely focussed on Birmingham, a number of organisations out

of Birmingham were contacted for help, and an email sent to all local authority arts contacts in the region. The difficulty of locating the artists may go a long way to explain why so many of the artists feel isolated, and are unaware of support agencies that could help them.

Art Form Breakdown

Art form specialism

Visual Arts	9
Crafts	6
Photography	2
Moving Image	1
Digital Media	
Design	2
Live art	
More than 1	10
	30

The striking element of this analysis is the amount of artists working across various media. There is no real pattern within the “mixed” category, since this includes both artists working across expected groupings such as photography/digital media/moving image, and others working across a far more disparate group (e.g. live arts, craft and visual arts in one case)

Professional qualifications

Analysis of qualifications

Up to:-		%
Postgraduate	6	20%
BA (creative)	11	37%
Foundation	4	13%
A level or equivalent	0	0%
GCSE or equivalent	1	3%
Teaching qualification	3	10%
Other BA (physics. Philosophy)	2	7%
Other – 1 curating, 1 various creative modules at Open		
University & others	2	
None	5	17%
	34	

NB the total no. is greater than the total artists in the survey as 4 artists hold other qualifications alongside their main professional qualification (e.g. in teaching). In common with other surveys on visual artists, this demonstrates a high level of educational qualification. However the amount with no

qualifications appears to be significantly higher than in most general artist surveys.

Income categories

Breakdown of income

Teaching/Lecturing	18%
Private Tuition	0%
Leading & facilitating participatory & community work	23%
Sales of works	15%
Public Art Commissions	3%
Other arts work	7%
Other non arts work	34%
Total	100%

This gives averages across all 30 artists, which disguises some significant variations, which ranged from 3 artists earning more than 80% of their income from teaching, with 6 who earn little or nothing within the arts, with 90 to 100% of their income coming from non arts activity. The figure for sales is low at 15% average, which is an accurate reflection across the range of all the artists, with only 3 earning 50% or more of their income from sales, and 14 earning nothing from sales.

Training requirements

Personal Creative Practice	Total scoring
Development of creative practice	189
Promoting yourself & your work	181
Business planning & management	117
Personal development skills (e..g negotiating)	106
Starting out in professional practice	103
New Technology	99
Legal issues	92
Time Management	74

	Total scoring
Working with Others	
Publicity & marketing	155
Working with galleries & retail outlets	130
Community & participatory work	127
Fundraising	112
Public art/commissioning	108
Presentation skills	90
Project initiation & management	87
Working in education settings	77
Monitoring & evaluation	73
Starting up an arts organisation	68
Disability/access awareness	61
Youth work	56

The artists chose from a list of options for training needs for both their personal creative needs, and to help them to work with others. The preference for creative practice training is clear, and relates to the relatively high level of take up by the artists of creative & technical skills training (see below for training undertaken). Otherwise there is a clear priority for both self promotion, and for general marketing skills.

Types of training preferred

Preferences for types of training provision

One to one mentoring	16
Intensive Residential Weekend Course	12
Course of day long workshops (weekdays)	10
As above (weekends)	9
Course of weekly evening sessions	6
Apprenticeship/Placement Working	4

The artists were given a range of options for the type of training they would prefer, with a clear preference for mentoring. There appears to be little interest in apprenticeships, possibly given the time commitment this would involve. From the analysis of training actually undertaken given below, it does not appear that

any of the artists involved have had any formal mentoring support at all, in contrast to their desire for this kind of intervention.

Training and professional development undertaken in the past 3 years

Training undertaken

Percentage of artists undertaking	57%
No. of artists undertaking	17

Types of training undertaken	No. of people undertaking
Technical/creative skills	10
General professional development	9
Early years	3
IT skills	1
Cultural leadership	1
Participatory skills	1
Funding advice	1
Business development	1
	27

The figure of 27 is greater than the total no. of artists undertaking training, as several artists undertook more than one type of training.

There was considerable variation here with 13 of the artists undertaking no training at all, compared to several who avidly took up a range of training opportunities.

There is a clear preference for technical and creative skills courses, which were generally rated highly by the artists. General professional development courses, such as those offered by Creative Alliance and Flying Start, were the next most popular. The rating for these general courses varied hugely, with some artists giving very high scores and others giving much lower scores. As the ratings are subjective, and not all artists gave rating figures, it has not been possible to give any coherent assessment of the value given to the various forms of training by the artists, other than the generally high approval rating for technical & creative skills training.

It is interesting that so few artists had undertaken training in participatory skills, given the relatively high placing given to this requirement by the artists.

The artists had used a wide range of training providers - 24 in total:

Training providers

Creative Alliance

Flying Start/BCC

Playtrain

Vivid

Second Sight

RBSA

TIC

Cotswold (silk painting)

Long Patten (tailoring -
Stoke)

Konetica (London) Carnival
costume

Goldsmiths Guild

Jewellers Association

UCE software course

Gallery 37 (sound)

Screen West Midlands

Playhouse theatre

City College

Hybrid

Drum

Community Arts & Media

HLF

Craftspace/Play Train

Collide

Black Country Touring -

Revolve

Sampad

APPENDIX 10

BIBLIOGRAPHY

By Arts Council England/ other regions

The arts Britain ignores: The arts of ethnic minorities in Britain, Khan, Naseem,
London: Arts Council of Great Britain, 1976

The Arts and Ethnic Minorities: Action Plan, London: Arts Council of Great
Britain, 1986

The Arts and Cultural Diversity, Arts Council of Great Britain, London: Arts
Council of Great Britain, 1989

Audit of Research into audiences for Black & Asian work, Administration, Research, Training Services, for ACE, 1998

Archiving the Arts of England's Culturally Diverse Communities, mpr ltd., ACE, October 1999

Art is Black, Culturally Diverse Artists on Show, decibel in association with the Guardian, 2005

Creative Yorkshire: Visual artists in shared workspaces: resources and facilities, ACEY

Inclusion, involvement and investment: Bangladeshi heritage communities and the arts in the North West of England, Radhia Tarafder on behalf of Sonali Network, Commissioned by Arts Council England, North West,

Participation of Black and minority ethnic Students in Higher Education Art and Design, Literature Review, Commissioned by Arts Council England, Rohini Malik Okon, September 2005

By Arts Council England, West Midlands

Asian, Caribbean and African Arts Strategy, Qnun Ltd, October 1992

Asian, Caribbean and African Arts Strategy, Consultation Paper, West Midlands Arts with Indigo Consultants, October 1999

Training and Development needs of artists working in participatory settings in the West Midlands, Felicity Woolf Associates for ALISS, 2004

Governmental Reports

Improving Opportunity, Strengthening Society: The Government's strategy to increase race equality and community cohesion, 2005

The arts of ethnic minorities: A reading guide. London: Commission for Racial Equality, 1983

The Journey to Race Equality, Audit Commission, 2004

The journey to race equality: Delivering improved services to local communities, 'Public Sector Self-Assessment Tool', Audit Commission, 2004

Other Publications

Avtarjeet Dhanjal, Cross, P. and Tawadros, Gilane, (ed) London: inIVA, 1997

'Black art: a discussion'. Third Text Winter: 51-62, Araeen, Rasheed and Eddie Chambers, 1988

The Black Local History & Cultural Archives Project, Birmingham City Council,
Birmingham City Council, Visual Arts Strategy, 2000/01

'De Margin and De Centre. The Last "Special Issue" on Race?' Julien, Isaac and Kobena Mercer, Screen 29, no. 4: 2-11, 1988

History of the Study into Black Arts in Birmingham, Black Arts Forum, December 1988

Screen West Midlands: Cultural Diversity Research Programme, 2002

South Asian Arts in Sandwell, Development Plan, Alan Dix, 1998

South Asian Contemporary Visual Arts Strategy, Juginder Lamba, 1994

Hidden Histories, Cultural diversity and heritage in the West Midlands, HLF , Ian Grosvenor, December 2003

Orientalism, Edward Said, London, Penguin, 1978

'Problems facing Black artists' Art Monthly 26, Araeen, Rasheed, 1979

The Artpack: A history of Black artists in Britain, Chambers, Eddie, Tam Joseph and Juginder Lamba (eds.) London: Haringey Arts Council, 1988

'There ain't no Black in the Union Jack': The cultural politics of 'race' and nation, Gilroy, Paul, London: Hutchinson, 1987

The struggle for Black arts in Britain: What can we consider better than freedom, Owusu, Kwesi, London: Comedia, 1986

Vanley Burke: a retrospective, Sealy, Mark London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1993

Welcome to the jungle: New positions in Black cultural studies, Mercer, Kobena, London: Routledge, 1994

The Wolverhampton Partnership, Creative Industries – Assessing the Wolverhampton Offer, Draft, April 2004

Why 'Third Text'? Third Text 1: 3-5, Araeen, Rasheed, 1987

Websites (sample)

- Black Arts Alliance
- A:N
- Arts & Media Training
- Artists Newsletter
- Arnolfini
- Autograph
- Axis
- Creative Alliance
- Creative Launchpad
- Creative People
- Diversity Arts Forum
- Engage
- inIVA
- Longhouse
- Hothouse, Stoke On Trent
- Rhubarb Rhubarb
- Shisha

APPENDIX 11

LIST OF INDIVIDUALS CONSULTED

STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

Abid Hussain, Officer, Diversity, ACEWM

Alex Boyd, Curator, Midlands Arts Centre, Birmingham

Anna Douglas, Officer, Digital Media & Photography

Ammo Talwar, Director, Punch

Alison Taylor, The Herbert

Alnoor Mitha, Director, Shisha

Andrew Hunt, Curator, International Project Space, Bournville School of Art, UCE, Birmingham

Anita Dinham, Audiences Central/Arts Council England WM Diversity Officer

Anneka Joy, Gallery 37, Birmingham City Council

Caitlin Griffiths, Adviser: Professional Issues, Museums Association, Diversify Scheme

Caroline Foxhall, ACEWM

Catherine Fishwick, Solihull Arts Complex

Cheryl Jones, Curator, [insertspace], Birmingham

Chloe Brown, Longsight

Deb Slade, Walsall Creative Development Team

Deirdre Figueiredo, Director, Craftspace

Errol Francis, Inspire Fellowship Manager, ACEL

Gavin Wade, Artist-Curator, Eastside Projects, Birmingham

Jackie Lee, Officer, Crafts

Joan Dwyer, University of Wolverhampton
Joan Gibbons, Course Director, MA Contemporary Curatorial Practice,
Birmingham Institute of Art and Design (BIAD), University of Central England
John Leslie, Curator, Compton Verney, Warwickshire
Jonathan Watkins, Director, Ikon Gallery, Birmingham
Kathryn Standing, Visual Arts Officer, Visiting Arts
Lara Ratnaraja, Birmingham Chamber of Commerce
Mari Considine, RBSA
Mark Ball, Director, Fierce
Mark Sealey, Director, Autograph
Mark Waugh, Consultant, International Curators Forum
Michael Cooke, MLA
Mukhtar Dar, Director of Arts, the Drum
Owen Hurcombe, Staffordshire ADO
Pat Dawson, Flying Start, Birmingham City Council
Piali Ray, Director, Sampad
Rhonda Wilson, Rhubarb
Richard Elms, The Herbert
Sandra Hall, Friction Arts
Sarah Blackstock, Freelance Curator
Sarah Miah, Curatorial Trainee at MAC, Birmingham, and ICF participant
Sarah Shalgosky, Curator, Mead Gallery, Warwick Arts Centre
Simon Redgrave, Freelance Curator
Stephen Earl Rodgers, Project Co-ordinator, Periscope, Birmingham
Su Jones, Director, a:n
Timandra Gustaffson, Director, Axis
Tim Bryan, Culture WM
Trevor Pitt, Freelance Curator/ Artist
Toby Watley, Head of Interpretation & Exhibitions, Birmingham Museum and Art
Gallery
Tom Trevor, Director, Arnolfini
Yasmeen Baig-Clifford, Director, Vivid

ARTISTS INTERVIEWS

Amerjit Kaur Hayden
*Anand Chhabra
Anita Kaushik
Claudette Holmes
Colin Gabbidon
Dilwara Begum
Gursharan Channa
Harmeet Chagger-Khan
Jiva Parthipan
Juginder Lamba
Kim Lee

Maria Attah
Maria Onyegbule
Mark Carrol
Matthew Krishanu
Mazzy Malik
*Mohsen Keiany
Nadeem Arif
*Naz Koser
Pam Anderson
Pauline Bailey
Ranbir Kaur
Rehana Vohra
Rita Patel
Rubi Sufi
Mumtaz Shah
*Nasreen Rajabali
Nelson Douglas
Sakab Bashir
Shaheen Ahmed
Sharon Morgan
Sima Gronsai
Suhair Al-Khayat
Shivani Patel
*Steven McLean
Surjit Simplay

* Indicates Action Research Artist

ATTENDED CRITICAL DIALOGUE SESSIONS

Professional Development - facilitator Belinda Kidd

- Joan Gibbons, Course Director, MA Contemporary Curatorial Practice, University of Central England
- Jean Dyson, School of Art and Design, Wolverhampton University
- Annie Laughrin, Creative Alliance
- Jeanne Jenner, Arts and Media Training, Coventry
- Mohsen Keiany, Action Research artist
- Steve McLean, Action Research artist
- Naz Koser, Action Research artist
- Anand Chabra, Action Research artist
- Nasreen Rajabali, Action Research artist

How is difference valued – facilitator Samina Zahir

- Chloe Brown, Longsight
- Gavin Wade, Independent Curator, Researcher, UCE
- Simon Redgrave, freelance curator
- Rob Hewitt, Freelance curator/ Birmingham City Council Arts Team
- Pervaiz Khan, Hybrid Researcher
- Mohsen Keiany, Action Research artist
- Steve McLean, Action Research artist
- Naz Koser, Action Research artist
- Anand Chabra, Action Research artist
- Nasreen Rajabali, Action Research artist

Bursting the Banks – facilitator Zoe Shearman

- Ammo Talwar, Director, Punch
- Deborah Robinson, Senior Curator, Exhibitions & Programmes, New Art Gallery, Walsall
- Deirdre Figueiredo, Director, Craftspace
- Liz Rowe, Independent curator
- John Leslie, Curator, Compton Verney
- Mukhtar Dar, Director of Arts, the drum
- Michael Cooke, Museums Libraries and Archives Council, West Midlands